

TICK MANAGEMENT TASK FORCE MEETING MINUTES

IR-2114-200 Res 1123-2006-

Mon April 7, 2008

Meeting #9- Old Infirmary Yaphank

Attendees: Eight voting Members and four non-voting members were present. Eva, Fernando, Laura, Ilia, Dom, Vinnie, Kristy, Dr. Scott, Dr. Tim , Rae, Amy, Dr. Sal (See attached)

Agenda: An Agenda for Meeting #9 was distributed (see attached). It was to vote on all Chapters as being final, some with minor revisions. Dr. Sal Scarpitta was the Chair. Meeting convened at 9:35 AM.

Eva requested 5 minutes to speak. The Chair granted her request. Eva read a prepared statement regarding the under reporting of Lyme cases on Long Island. She said the decline of confirmed Lyme disease was not consistent with reality and that a statement in the Final report should say that the data presented in Section 2 are a factor of ten times or more high than stated. She also alleged that cases were not properly entered into HIN by PH staff. She referenced a PH person by the initials "ES" who provided her with that information. Dr. Dillon's name was mentioned as well as Dr. Scarpitta (Chair) and Kristy Cimaglia (Public Health Educator), all in a negative light. Dr. Dillon was targeted as an obstacle to establishing the TMTF based on testimony that she gave to the SC Legislature several years ago. Eva used the phrase "whistle blower" in her read statement which agitated one TMTF member who threatened to leave the meeting. The Chair asked him to hold off. She stated that her Letter was already submitted to Mr. Ed Romaine (and perhaps others) for an "investigation".

The Chair responded by saying that there is no 'conspiracy' to report Lyme cases at SCDHS as these issues are controlled by the CDC criteria for classifying a case as Confirmed, Suspect or Probable and that an Appendix was added to the TMTF Final Report by the Chair, defining CDC criteria for case reporting. . The Chair explained that as of Jan 2007, the CDC instructed SCDHS to enter 20% of the Suffolk Lyme disease cases into the NYS DOH CDESS database, while the other 80% were possibly being entered by State personnel. Data presented in Section 2 of the TMTF Final Report stopped at 2006 and represent 100% of all cases in the CDESS database. The Chair also stated that Dr. Dillon is no longer at Public Health but was transferred to a Clinic on the South Fork.

The Chair reiterated that Section 2 in the Final Report (Incidence of Tick Borne Diseases in Suffolk County) only looked at confirmed cases in Suffolk over a ten year period (1999 to 2006). The author of Section 2 (i.e., the Chair) read the statement that will appear in the Final Report to the TMTF. It said

"The CDC has defined three classifications for data that are maintained in Public Health databases, such as CDESS, for disease tracking purposes. They are: Confirmed, Probable, and Suspected (See Appendix IV). Only confirmed cases were used in this analysis. This

means that the total numbers of confirmed, probable and suspected cases for tick-borne diseases in Suffolk are higher than the confirmed cases presented. “

The Chair finally stated the reason for preparing the maps was to determine geographical areas where tick disease incidence is most high. This decision was made by the TMTF at our earlier meetings.

In order to maintain a quorum, the Chair convinced the agitated TMTF member to stay so that we could vote on accepting the Sections, according to the planned agenda.

Amy suggested that EVA should have brought this issue to the table before issuing her read statement to Mr. Romaine. Amy said Eva's actions have undermined TMTF member 'confidentiality' regarding issues that the Task Force members might discuss but might not necessarily become part of the Final Report. Amy further stated that Eva's actions have now implanted an unwillingness of said members to participate in future Task Forces.

The Chair requested that Eva submit an electronic copy (to him) of her statement for inclusion in the Minutes.

The Chair proceeded to move the meeting forward, according to the attached Agenda, and was interrupted by Eva. The Chair denied her additional time to speak until the issue of voting on Chapters was completed.

Agenda Items requiring Voting:

Section 5. Pub Ed Section. Voted Acceptable with minor Changes. No objections.

Section 1: Tick Bio Section. Review section for consistency message. Vote for approval accepted with modifications. No objections.

Sect 3: Vote was to accept with minor modifications. Dr. Scott recommends use phrase toxic chemical with minimal risk in Sub-section III. No objections.

Section 4. Make modification and add recommendation. Issue of tick reduction and deer reduction statement was raised by Rae. She read from Ref. Humane Society of US.

There is a need to Change Task Force Summary and Conclusions to reflect that concern. Dr. Tim will do this. Vote was to accept . No objections.

Sect 6. Options Tick Control. Vote was to accept as is, with minor modifications. No objections. Add sentence or two on how DPVC can integrate it's expertise with other methods of tick management not discussed in Sect 3; i.e., Parks and Public lands. Include new addition EC, Section 6. Dominick will do this.

Section 7. Add statement that a detailed Epidemiological study may need to be performed before the County embarks on an EIS and SEQRA. Vote was to accept. No objections.

Section 2 was voted on by the voting TMTF members and was accepted, with 1 objection by Eva.

TMTF members agreed that the Chair provide an advance copy to the Commissioner of Health and the CE, without opportunity to provide comments or changes. This is because the TMTF is terminated on May 15, 2008.

Eva requested that the \$5K allocated in the TMTF budget be applied to a 'Lyme Disease Cause'. The Chair indicated that allocation of funds would require Legislative approval and that this request would be denied based on the language in IR-2114-2006. . The TMTF all agreed on that statement.

Laura is fixing the Member list: Name and Agency. Amy is MPH.

Note: Vincent Palmer indicated that he was an original non-voting member and that the 3 invited members are also non- voting.

Dr. Scott. Change every occurrence of tick "control" to management where practical.

Section authors will provide Chair with a list of Acronyms for inclusion in final report.

Tentative date next meeting May 5th Monday Infirmery 9:30 AM . This may be cancelled if the TMTF members agree via e-mail) that the minor changes are acceptable. Chair will submit the Final Report with minor modifications to all members in PDF format.

The alternative is that only Section authors meet to insure that the modifications, discussed above, have been made.

Meeting adjourned: 11:35 AM

SUFFOLK COUNTY TICK MANAGEMENT TASK FORCE ROSTER

Intro Resoltion # 2114-2006

Meeting No. 9 Yaphank

Meeting Date: Mon Apr 7 2008

	Member Name or ALT	Agency Name	Initials	E-Mail
1	Dr. Salvatore C. Scarpitta	SC Dept. Health Services	√	salvatore.scarpitta@suffolkcountyny.gov
2	Dominick Ninivaggi	County Executive Off.	√	dominick.ninivaggi@suffolkcountyny.gov
	Ilia Rochlin (alt)		√	
3	Dr. David Parkinson	SC Legislature, PO		parkinson82@optonline.net
4	Dr. Timothy Green	Brookhaven Nat'l Lab	√	tgreen@bnl.gov
5	Rae Lapides	Shelter Island Deer and	√	raelapides@optonline.net
	Pat Schillingburg	Tick Committee		pat@takus.com
6	Dr. Scott Campbell	SCDHS	√	
7	Laura Bavaro	Nature Conservatory	√	lbavaro@TNC.org
8	Mrs. Marcia Bystryn	League of Conservation		mbystryn@nylcv.org
	Ilene Kaplowitz (Alt)	Voters		
9	Deborah Long	US Fish & Wildlife		deborah_long@fws.gov
	Michele Williams (Alt)			
10	Fernando Villalba	National Parks Service & Fire Island Nat'l Seashore	√	fernando_villalba@nps.gov
11	Vincent Palmer	NYS DEC, Region Dir.	√	vapalmer@gw.dec.state.ny.us
	Chris Spies (Alt)			
12	Amy Juchatz-Camanzo	Dept of Envirronment & Energy	√	amy.juchatz@suffolkcountyny.gov
13	Eva Haughie	Empire State Lyme Disease Assoc.	√	eva@empirestatelda.org
	Kristy Cimaglia (Invited)	PH Educator	√	Kristy.Cimaglia@suffolkcountyny.gov

Tick Management Task Force (TMTF) - Meeting Agenda

Meeting No: 9

Meeting Date: Monday April 7, 2008 – Old Infirmary Auditorium, Yaphank

Voting Issues: Accept Section Drafts for Conversion into Final TMTF Report

ACTION ITEM	TASK	SUB-TASK	TIME ALLOTMENT	VOTE (Y=YES)
1. Administrative	Accept Prior Minutes from Mar. 10 Meeting		2 min	Y
2. Review Outline for Report Content and CD ROM	See Outline Attachment	Addition of 2 new Sections to Report	5 min	
3. Approve Chapter Drafts ES- Exec Summary S1 – Ecology S2 – Disease Incidence S3 – Pesticides S4 – Host Management S5 – Public ED S6 – Control Options S7 – Unresolved Issues S8 - Appendices	Vote on Section Approvals	Section Authors Prepare a list of revisions for Sections that are not approved. Provide List to Chair	70 min	Yes (On all Sections)
Path Forward	1. CE and SCDHS Commissioner Review 2. Production of PDF and CD-ROM	All Members will get Final PDF Report via E-Mail		N
6. Next Meeting Date	Optional	Only Section Heads		
<i>The TMTF Terminates on May 15 2008</i>				

OUTLINE FOR TMTF FINAL REPORT in PDF

- √Cover Letter
- √ List of Members & Affiliations
- List of Acronyms
- List of Tables and Figures (?)

Table of Contents

- Body of Text
- Appendices List
- √ CD-ROM (Ancillary Material on separate CD)

***Executive Summary**

- √Text and Recommendations (5+ from each Section) (D)
- √ List of Integrated Strategies Considered by TF
- Path Forward – Future TF Committees

Body of Text

- √ Section 1: Tick Biology and Ecology with Special Reference to Suffolk County
- √ Section 2: Incidence of Tick Borne Diseases in Suffolk County
- √Section 3: Pesticide Related Tick Management (D)
- √Section 4: Host Management
- √Section 5: Public Education (D)
- √ Section 6: Options for Tick Control in Suffolk County
- √Section 7: Unresolved Task Force Issues and Path Forward (D)
- √Section 8: Appendices

CD ROM

Hard-Copy of TMTF Document

**Executive Summary Stand-Alone Version with Members and Cover Letter
Lyme and Tick Disease Brochures (?)**

- √ Members Opening Statements - from Meeting 1
- √ TMTF Administrative Material
 - Meeting Minutes and Agendas
 - TF Resolution and Original Member List
 - Task Force By-Laws – Robert’s Rules
 - Public Hearing Notices, Contacts and Minutes
 - TMTF Correspondences by Chair
- √ CDC Handbook on Tick Management –Stafford (PDF)

√ = **Materials in-hand and Report Formatted:**
D = Draft Version

