

***SUFFOLK COUNTY LEGISLATURE***

***EQUESTRIAN TASK FORCE***

***MINUTES***

A meeting of the Equestrian Task Force of the Suffolk County Legislature was held at the Southaven Lodge in Southaven County Park on Wednesday, January 13, 2010 at 3:00 P.M.

***Members Present:***

Rob Calarco - Acting Chair/Representing Legislator Eddington-Chair  
John Pavacic - Commissioner/Suffolk County Parks Department  
Janet Plympton - Long Island Professional Horsemen's Assoc.  
Jessica Kalmbacher - Representing Tom Isles - Director/SC Planning  
Kay Intemann - Nassau-Suffolk Horseman's Association  
Denise Spezio - Nassau-Suffolk Horseman's Association

***Members Not Present:***

Pam Greene - Director/SC Div of Real Property, Acquisition & Management  
Gigi Asher - SC Superior Officer's Association  
Steve Laton - SCSPCA  
Rocky DiVello - Long Island Farm Bureau  
Dave Macknee - East End Supervisors and Mayors Association

***Also in Attendance:***

Ellen Stitt - Aide to Legislator Eddington  
Sally Rosenblas - Long Island High Score Awards Association  
Denis D'Vachio - Long Island Professional Horsemen's Assoc  
Sean Browning - Brookhaven Resident  
All Other Interested Parties

***Verbatim Minutes Taken By:***

Alison Mahoney - Court Reporter

***Verbatim Transcript Prepared By:***

Denise Weaver - Legislative Aide

*(\*The meeting was called to order at 3:14 P.M.\*)*

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. If I can, we might as well get started here. I thank everybody for coming down again. I'm Rob Calarco, I'm filling in for Legislator Jack Eddington. Perhaps we could go around the room. We probably all know each other today, we don't have too many new faces, but let's go around the room and introduce ourselves. Janet?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Janet Plympton, Long Island PHA.

**MS. KALMBACHER:**

Jessica Kalmbacher, Suffolk County Planning.

**MS. INTEMANN:**

Kay Intemann, Nassau-Suffolk Horsemen's.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Denise Speizio, Nassau-Suffolk Horsemen's.

**MS. STITT:**

Ellen Stitt, Legislative Aide for Jack Eddington.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

John Pavacic, Suffolk County Parks.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Thanks. I wanted to start today, we're just doing a little bit of housekeeping issues regarding membership. We don't have too many of our members here today, so it might be tough to make some of these decisions. But there's a couple of individuals that we -- or slots that we basically have open that have not had any representatives attend any of our meetings. The first was -- is Dave Macknee who is the appointment for the East End Supervisor's Association; he just simply has not shown up to a meeting. I think what we should do from the task force is perhaps send a letter or contact Supervisor Cardinale who was -- well, I guess -- I don't even know who's going to be the --

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

Walter, Sean Walter is the new Riverhead Supervisor.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

I wonder if he's taken on the title, head of East End Supervisor's Association? We'll have to track down who has that title and see if we can't get ourselves a new appointee from the organization. I think after -- we've had about five or six meetings now, we haven't had an appointee from there show up. So that's the first item that I wanted to address. Is everybody comfortable with that?

*"Yes" said in unison*

The second one being original -- the original legislation had an appointee for the Suffolk County Village Officials Association. We were never able to get a response or anybody to be appointed to that position from the organization, so we did amend the resolution to create a spot for an individual with planning or zoning experience.

We had somebody in mind that the Legislature thought might work; Doug {Ditco} who's pretty involved in the industry and also was President of the Planning Board for a little while for --

*(\*Mr. D'Vachio entered the meeting\*)*

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Hello.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

-- the Town of Brookhaven, unfortunately his work constraints is going to keep him from being able to join us. So I'd like to open up to ask if anybody has any other suggestions of possible appointees who might fill that role or any ideas of anybody who might fit that criteria, somebody who has some planning, zoning experience that might be interested? I'll throw it out there. If anybody has any ideas at the next meeting or would like to e-mail me in between, I'd appreciate it, so we could get the position filled. We had a couple of new people come in?

**MS. STITT:**

You don't recognize him? Sure you do.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Yeah, Sean?

**MR. BROWNING:**

Yes. How have you been?

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Sean Browning. How are you?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Denis D'Vachio.

**MR. BROWNING:**

Sean Browning.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Excuse me?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Denis D'Vachio.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Denis D'vachio, okay.

So that's my little bit of housekeeping I wanted to touch upon real quickly. So if anybody has any ideas for either of those positions, I'm sure the East End Supervisor's Association would welcome suggestions as far as anybody on their end that might be able to serve in that capacity as well.

On to new business. I thought today what we could try to do is actually go over a list of items that Janet had provided a while back, a couple of meetings ago, regarding different activities or types of equestrian outfits that are out there. And I was hoping that we might be able to go around and Janet, maybe you could be our lead person to give us some background and discussion, and anybody else who wants to join in, to just go through it and identify what the different types of equestrian activities are actually taking place in Suffolk County and what their specific type needs might be.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Types of activities.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Well, you have here riding schools and academies. You have, you know, breeding facilities, you have boarding facilities.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Uh-huh.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

And so I thought maybe we could go through your list of facilities --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay, okay.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

-- and talk about them.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

We can talk about facilities or we can talk about --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Well, let's start with facilities.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay, is that a better way of doing it?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yeah, that's fine. I kind of grouped the horse owners, people that own horses, into two categories here; obviously those that keep their horses at home and those that don't keep their horses at home, they board them somewhere.

Group one, they can pay full board, they can pay rough board. Rough board is they do part of the work, full board can constitute basic, general care so you never have to show up, or all the way down to when you do show up your horse is dressed and ready to walk to the ring or whatever veterinary things have to happen. Full board can incorporate a lot of things. Rough board, obviously there's several different rough boards, whether you want to supply feed, you want to supply the work, you want to supply the feed and the work; it can be a multitude of different stages of rough board.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Well, when we talk about -- can we maybe focus in on like a boarding operation?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

A boarding operation.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

So someone who operates a boarding operation, what are the basic -- what does that basically mean that they're providing?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Well, they're providing the facility and anything that the facility can offer which would be riding rings, turnout areas, anything from tack rooms, stabling areas, grooming areas, lunging areas. Some people can provide parking areas for trailers. Some of the barns are on trails, so they don't personally provide the trails, but you can use the trails if they're near or on a park system.

Some facilities provide trainers or they allow outside trainers to come in. They also provide perhaps

shipping; if you don't own your own trailer, you want to go to the horse shows, you want to hunt, you want to go somewhere, they can provide shipping and they may have their own truck or trailer, the barn. They provide all of the -- usually all of the maintenance that goes into tending to the farm, to the horses. They handle -- some boarding facilities handle setting up your blacksmith schedule, setting up your veterinary schedules, some don't.

Again, this all comes under whether you want to do a full board situation. Rough board, obviously it's far more hands-on, you're involved with your own horse.

Give me another question, Rob.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. So I guess -- then let's say that -- I mean, you have something similar?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Well, I have a very small boarding operation in my yard.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I do full board, I don't do any rough board.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I maintain all the horses, maintain the entire farm. And if someone were to leave their horse and never come back and continue to pay me month by month, the horse would be tended to, inside out and upside down. I don't have such of an operation where I tack and prepare the horse for you to ride, but I have an operation where the horse gets turned out, brought in, clothes get changed, blacksmith schedule, veterinary schedule gets taken care of.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. Now what kind of services or what kind of needs as a boarding operation do you have? I mean, do you have to bring somebody in who removes your manure, or do you --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

We remove our own manure.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

We do that once a week.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I don't -- I need a blacksmith. I allow outside trainers, but right now I don't have any that come in, everybody trains with me. Obviously, I have a barn vet. And I don't -- I'm kind of unique because I don't have any help.

**MS. STITT:**

Do you go and get your own hay out of -- off the Island, or you have it shipped in?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I have a hay guy Upstate. I have -- I use Agway as my feed guy; once a week he's in the yard.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Now, do you -- so you get your hay once a week, you don't have any kind of --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I get my hay -- I get eight tons at a time and I get it, I'd say every ten weeks or so.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

And how many -- well, I would guess, how many stalls do you have in your barn?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Seventeen.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Seventeen stalls in your barn? And do you have to provide -- you provide riding rings. Do you have access to trails?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

No, I don't have access to trails. I do have a riding ring. Again, some people do, some people don't. We maintain the riding ring, drag it pretty much everyday, it has lights, it has a sprinkler system. I also have a large grass field, fairly large, that we put some jumps in and people can ride there when we're not using it as a turnout. So I have actually two places to ride.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. And I guess --

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Do you provide transportation.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I do, I do provide transportation; thanks, Denis. I have my own truck and trailer.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. And do you -- but you don't actually own any of the horses on your property?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I do own four horses of my own.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

You own four, and then the others are --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yeah.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. And how do you -- you cart your manure once a week?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Once a week I cart my manure.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

And how do you store it? I mean, what's the procedure for a --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

It goes into a --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Until that once a week comes.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

-- dump trailer.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

We fill the dump trailer up in a week and it leaves the property.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

And you don't have any kind problems that you come across, flies or any of that type of issues?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I don't -- I have to say, you know, that's the trick.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Not to keep manure on your property. I mean, I've been there for 32 years and I would say the first ten or so I kept manure on my property.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

But that's pretty much the trick.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. Do you have a place that you can actually -- I mean, you said you cart it out once a week.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

A lot of people --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Do you sell it? Do you --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

-- use dumpsters.

**MS. MAHONEY:**

You can't talk over each other.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I'm sorry.

**MS. MAHONEY:**

No, it's okay. It's just hard to do both.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

A lot of people use dumpsters.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And I don't know where it goes but, you know, garbage companies will take -- leave you a dumpster, garbage companies will take it away. We've been fortunate to find someone who takes our trailer for \$7. Well, right now we have somebody that Rocky turned us onto who doesn't charge us at all, but when that runs out it's \$7 for a load, which is very reasonable. Manure removal is usually - wouldn't you say, Denis?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

It's a big expense.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

A pretty big expense and a pretty big pain in the butt.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Seven dollars for how much quantity; how many yards?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I don't know, 12-feet deep and four, five -- four-feet high.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

So that's like a ten to 20-yard dumpster.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay, okay. The trailer --

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

I have a 20-yard dumpster.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

And It's expensive.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yeah, I bet it is.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Because I have to pay \$120.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

A month?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

No, every two weeks.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Every two weeks, 120 bucks.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

To get that out.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Wow, to get that picked up?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

That's why I'm interested in what you're here to say. But you have the trailer yourself.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yeah, I have the trailer. So, I mean, it does cost me because I have to register the trailer.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

It's a good investment.

**MS. STITT:**

And you do all that work by yourself; you do all the mucking, everything?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Pretty much.

**MS. STITT:**

Wow, that's a lot of work for one person.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yeah, pretty much.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Especially in this weather.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Pretty much.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Brutal in this weather.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

So how much does it cost you, say, to bring in -- and now, I guess, maybe the better first question to start is for providing for the horses as far as feeding.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I wish that I, you know, could -- had I known that I would, you know, be -- do this, I could bring my, you know, basic financial statements from last year to tell you annually what it costs me to do anything, but I don't have that in front of me. So I --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

All right. Is the hay the only thing you have to bring in for the feed for the animals? I mean, do you have to provide anything else?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Grain.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

You have grain?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yep, supplements.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Supplements, you know, you can go anywhere and get supplements. There's tons of on-line places that a lot of people don't believe in it. Grain, there's such enormous variety, you know, of grain.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

It depends on the animal, too.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yep. Some horses don't eat a lot, some horses eat a lot. Some horses have a special diet, some horses need -- so it would be easier for me to just, you know, if you really need this information, I can send you generalized --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Well, we're just trying to get some --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I would be more than happy to, you know, offer what I pay --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

-- annually in feed, hay, shavings, all of that for you.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

If you could -- and certainly we don't need every last detail of your operation.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

No, I would not give you every last detail.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

But we're just looking -- that's what I'm looking for here is --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yes, What it costs. Well, and to be honest with you, I asked -- I started this project trying to put together -- because, you know, my situation is unique in that I don't have an enormous overhead, obviously, because I don't have help.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Help is an enormous overhead. Help and mortgage, insurance, those are big nuts.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

And taxes.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Taxes, yeah, those are -- I think those are probably the biggies. And I don't -- you know, our taxes are reasonable and I don't have anything else of that, so. So I'm a unique situation --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

-- because I do most everything myself, so I can kind of function pretty well. I did try to go on-line, tried to ask a couple of other farm owners and even small farm owners, large farm owners, whatever, just to give me a roundabout idea of how much do you bring in and how much do you spend, so that I could sit down and look at the figures and see how close they are. I got maybe three or four responses, because nobody wants to tell you anything, and I don't blame them; you know, don't get me wrong, I don't blame them.

One girl did give me a pretty good detailed -- I know her and I know her farm, it's very similar to what I have. She gave me a pretty detailed description of what goes out and what comes in, and she's working ridiculously tight, and that's on paper, so I'm telling that she's losing money.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Because if you're tight on paper you're losing money in reality.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. Are all the professional-type organizations or operations similar to yours and being a boarding facility, you have anything else out there?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

No. There's much larger things that have far more stalls. They do -- they have horse shows, they have a lesson program, they have a lease program.

**MS. INTEMANN:**

Indoor arenas.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yeah, indoor arenas. There are bigger things than I have, there are smaller things. I mean, there are a lot of backyard places that take two or three, four boarders to offset expenses. So boarding isn't strictly for the professional boarding barn owner.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

You know, the average guy in the backyard that has -- which is kind of how I ended up doing this. I bought a barn that had ten stalls in the backyard and I thought, "Wow, this is lucrative, let me add a few more. Wow, this is pretty lucrative, let me add a few more." So I think that's how it ends up, that people with four or five stalls in their yard, they have two horses, it's cheaper than boarding, and now to offset their own expenses they have two or three boarders in their yard.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. So --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And I think -- don't get me wrong, I'd love to address those zoning issues, too, on my own personal level, but I think that the -- the guy, the five stall, six stall, two stall guy, that's the person that we need to focus our attention on as far as zoning recommendations and whatnot.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

In my opinion. I am not sure that we have to concern ourselves with larger facilities like, I don't know, you guys are probably familiar with Dream Come True or Island Hills.

**MS. INTEMANN:**

Touch-N-Go.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Islandia Touch-N-Go, those kind of things. Maybe we don't have to concern ourselves quite so much with, but the smaller guy and me personally, only because I live in a residential area, so of course I have a personal interest in it all.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Well, I think what we found is that a lot of these are in residential areas.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Of course they are.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

And that's what brings us to have --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

The smaller ones, of course they are.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Denis, you own a similar type of operation?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Yes.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

It's a boarding facility?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

I live on my property.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

And I have some boarders and I back -- I'm a little bit unique, too, because I back up to a landfill.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

And so I have to deal with the problems of that.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

The odors and all.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Does that prevent neighbors from maybe necessarily getting upset about the horses on the

property?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

It helps. You see, that -- it helps me because I don't have as many neighbors surrounding me because of the landfill, but then I have to take what the landfill dishes out.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

A lot of dust, a lot of odor.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh. And how many horses do you have?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

I have ten.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Ten horses? And you have ten stalls in the barn?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Yeah.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

And some of my own and some are other peoples.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. And I'm going to go back to what you had said and maybe Denise can provide some more information here, but when we started talking about the smaller facility like a three or four in a backyard or something along those lines. I guess what I'm trying to grasp here is what -- to run and have a place where you have a barn with ten horses in it, what exactly do you need to do to make sure that your operation runs so that your neighbor doesn't actually know that you have ten horses if they didn't look over the fence?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Or wouldn't mind that you have ten horses. You know what I mean?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

What are -- what is it that we need to make recommendations? When we last spoke at the last meeting, we talked about having some sort of a sliding scale, having some sort of saying to the towns, "Okay, you know, we're going to put five horses on two acres, but we're going to have a specific type of manure storage facility so that that is maintained properly. We're going to have a specific storage area for our hay and our grain so that we don't have rodent problems coming up." What is it that we would want to tell the towns to say, "You know, this is why five horse on two acres would work"?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay. I jotted a couple of notes down. Making a farm or guaranteeing that a farm is neighbor friendly, which is where I think that the recommendation should be aimed at.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Yes.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I don't think that we should -- just to touch base on -- I don't think that any codes should be put in place to ensure property quality of life for equines, I don't think we're in that job. I think we're in the job to keep all the neighbors happy.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Yes.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And I came up with, you know, six items that I think are primary and I have found to be of the top issues that neighbors would have if they were to have any issues. I mean, I have small -- they have smaller issues which are ridiculous, but odor, flies, noise, dust, traffic and loose animals. My neighbors have a problem with my squirrels, but I didn't put that on my list because I thought that was a little extreme.

And I think that's -- those six pretty much cover what a non-horse neighbor would be concerned with.

And even if you haul your manure out weekly, daily, and you don't clean your pens up, you'll develop an odor, you will create flies, noise.

A lot of teaching. I can remember my neighbor had his horses in what we call pokey -- I call pokey pens. They're small, metal, circular pens, I'm sure you're familiar with that.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Port-a-fencing.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. MAHONEY:**

What fencing?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Port-a-fencing, it's like portable metal they pin together; you can make them small, big, whatever. And he kept them out all the time in these small pokey pens and he had buckets and he had them in the corner up against a neighbor, away from me because I'm his other neighbor. And I could hear the horses rattling the buckets on these metal fences all day long and I'm thinking, the guy's house over there can't be but five -- 50 feet from this -- I mean, I'm far, I'm my property and his property away, and that neighbor, who's not a horse person, has to listen to these rattling buckets all day, all night; He kept his horses out in these pokey pens all night. So, I mean, that's an incidence of noise. Dust is a big issue.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Dust is hard.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I have a sprinkler system on my riding ring, but I don't have it on my turnout pens. And my dirt, I have three grass pens, but my dirt pens can create some dust, and that's a little tricky.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

So you have a sprinkler system set up actually in one of the dirt pens?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

On my riding ring, on my riding ring.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

The riding ring.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yep.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

But that's grass?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

No, it's sand.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. But if --

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Years ago --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Yep.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Can I interrupt? Years ago we used to be able to use oil.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

He's right.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

And that kept my neighbors -- I was in another stable in East Northport and I was surrounded by neighbors -- not the landfill -- and we would oil our rings and that would totally take the dust out; like schoolyards were actually oiling their playgrounds. That became environmentally unfriendly because their groundwater --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

-- the oil would penetrate. So they stopped us from using that and that is when I think a lot of people had problems with dust.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right. And there is footing, certain footing that you can use in your riding rings, it's dust -- they claim it's dust-free or helps with the dust. It's expensive.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

If you can afford it.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right. But there's footing or things you can add to your footing that would help that are environmentally okay, that would help to keep the dust down. But dust is an issue with the neighbors. You can also put trees up, that helps with the dust. Arborvitae grow very rapidly and

tall.

*(\*Laughter\*)*

**MS. SPEZIO:**

As long as the deer don't eat them.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

That's right. Well, if you're in a residential neighborhood, there's not a lot of deer, especially where I am.

Traffic, lots of cars, lots of trucks, big trucks; that can be an issue.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

So when you -- say you're getting deliveries of hay?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Deliveries of hay or clientele. My clientele usually don't have to park on the road, but there are several places that, you know, your clientele has to park on the road; people don't like that.

And then the last thing is, of course, loose animals. Poor fencing, open gates. You know, in 32 years we've had a couple of those and the neighbors really don't like that on their sod.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

I'm sure they don't. But I'm sure at the same time --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Not a fan of the loose animals.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

-- most horse owners don't want their animals running loose either.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

No, exactly. So you would like to think that people would keep up on their fencing, keep on their gates, but a lot of people don't.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

It's also a liability.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Exactly.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

I had a neighbor when I first moved into my -- the place I live now, they had a horse that got loose and there are a lot of big hills and a little car came flying over the hill and the horse ran across the street and the car collided with the horse. The horse was killed, the person was injured, the car was destroyed, and there was a liability issue for the person who owned the horse.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And it can be a liability issue for the person who owned the farm.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Or the farm, too, yeah. So -- and actually, right after that, they didn't have horses anymore. Now, I don't know if that was exactly what was the reason why they don't have horses there anymore, but it was kind of close together it happened.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. So those are the six issues that you think we need to look at.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

You know, those are the six issues that through my life I've -- you know, have raised red flags.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

There's also that hot-wiring thing.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Electric fencing?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Yeah, some town ordinances don't like you to use them --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

-- or to contain the animal, and some places you're not allowed to do that.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I have that.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Sometimes if you get inspected, that can be a problem.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Oh, really?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

I'm in Islip.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

You know, so the poor guy --

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

You're only restricted from the road-front?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Pardon?

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

From the road itself or can you use it within your backyard?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

No, not even within your backyard.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Huh.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Because if some visitor comes over who does have a pacemaker or something like that, it could affect them. That's what I was told by somebody who inspected my property.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Wow.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

So you have to be careful with that. It's a great way of controlling the animal and keeping it off the roads, but you have to check your zoning about that.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. So that's our basics for the boarder or the stable. Now, is there a difference between a boarding operation and a stable operations; is that an interchangeable word?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

That's like -- I don't know. Yeah.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I mean, a stable is anyplace that you keep animals. A boarding operation is anyplace that for financial -- you know, financially keeps animals.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Pays you to keep animals.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yeah, in exchange for monies they keep animals.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. I'm trying to take this for my approaches --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay. You know, I mean, there are --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

-- not knowing anything about the industry, which I really don't know anyway, so.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Most larger stables do boarding.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

But they obviously do lessons and they obviously lease horses and they -- there's a lot of other aspects to this whole thing.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Horse shows.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right, do a lot of training, blah, blah, blah. But usually boarding is a main function of a larger barn.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I mean, I guess if you wanted to separate the two just for language, say there's a facility and boarding is a function.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Uh -- huh.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

If you just wanted to separate it.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. So that was part four in your handout that you had put together for us that we kind of went right into.

What about a riding school or academies? Are these -- when we talk about those types of places, are we talking strictly, you know, they're going to own all their own horses? Are they going to potentially be boarders that provide training there or riding classes?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Not necessarily, not necessarily. Riding schools can also -- they can offer boarding. People can take lessons on their own horses, they can take lessons on the barn's horses. And there are places that if you board your horse there for a less fee, they can use your horse in their lesson program. So it can be one way, you take -- you know, like you take lessons on your own horse or you offer your horse for lessons. So, but riding schools and academies, they're becoming less and less, unfortunately, which is like a huge crime.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And we're focusing more and more on the individual and its training instructor and owning your own horse and not so many places to take lessons for the average guy who doesn't own their own horse and who would like to start; that's getting less and less.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. Denise, when we start talking about a smaller -- maybe someone who just keeps a horse in their backyard.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Yeah, I keep mine at home.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. What kind of, I guess, situations do you come across that may be different from what Janet has explained?

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Well, pretty much the same as what Janet has. The only difference is I don't live in a close, tight residential area. I have three acres. Most of my neighbors are all one to three acres, so we're a little bit spread apart. Ridge is a little more rural. There's a higher expectation of animals, farm animals, we have a mixture of other, you know, cows, pigs, stuff like that. So they're less of a nuisance.

Our problem is the newer neighborhoods that are coming in. We're very big on preservation, but in an effort to do that, the newer communities coming in are set on smaller lots, so they're bringing in non-equestrians. So they'll move into, you know, the area. They see the horses, but they don't realize, you know, what the horses are all about, so. But the issues that Janet already listed are really the main ones. I don't really think I can think of any other ones.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. I do have a couple of handouts here. Nicole Spinelli, who was at the last meeting from Soil & Water -- she wasn't able to make it today but she will be at the next meeting -- She's done a little bit of research for us. And there's a couple of handouts I have here and I'll -- I can e-mail these out to people as well, and they're just some best management practices that have developed from a different -- a couple of other places, one's from San Diego and one's from Penn State, and the Penn State one I think actually talks specifically about horse stable manure management; it was interesting reading. So I brought out four copies of each. And like I said, I can e-mail these out to anyone who would like a copy electronically.

**MS. KALMBACHER:**

Would you please e-mail me one?

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Sure.

**MS. KALMBACHER:**

Thank you.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

So, they actually did talk about, I think the horse manure, one actually gives us -- one of the questions we had at the last meeting was how many -- how much manure does a horse produce, and their guidelines here say about 31 pounds per a thousand pound horse. So they've actually got a whole write-up here, I guess it's about -- including their bedding that must be removed from a stable that would accumulate with the manure, you're talking about 2.4 cubic feet of material that you're removing per a thousand pound horse. So that kind of gives us some guidelines I think we can work upon.

Nicole promised that for the next meeting, she'd actually have some recommendations from her organization, from Soil & Water and also from the USDA about some of this material that she's found that she can provide to us as far as, you know, what kind of manure storage do you need to have depending on how many horses you have. So there's talk about, you know, if you only have a small operation with one or two horses, maybe you're a small homeowner, you could just have garbage pails, in a sense.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

I've seen that done.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

But if you have a bigger operation, you might need -- they have kind of like a setup where you have like a backstop and drainage to it and everything else, so that if you have maybe ten horses on your

property, you would be able to store it better until you are able to remove it.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I was just going to ask if any of the information, she had included composting if the property allowed rather than just hauling it away. Because --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

I believe they do. And I believe that's actually in this Penn State report that she provided, it actually provides the two alternatives of composting versus storage and actual carting away. But I think, you know, when we had Rocky here last time, he said there are a number of farms out on the east end who are interested in getting manure as fertilizer, but the key there being that they need to have it come in clean so that it's not -- so they're actually just getting fertilizer and not getting anything mixed into it that they don't want to put into -- out there onto their farm.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Joe from the Long Island Farm Bureau said that he would meet with us or me, but that can't be until February.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

And Denise Octavio had sent some information about the manure, but unfortunately my printer is on the fritz.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

So I was not able to print or bring anything that I have today, so I'll bring the information that she sent next time.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. We've also reached out to Cornell Cooperative. And Ellen, you said that there's someone, do you remember -- do you have her name handy?

**MS. STITT:**

Yeah.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

They have an equestrian expert based out of -- is this person based out of Upstate?

**MS. STITT:**

Yeah, we have to write a written letter.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

That's the veterinarian.

**MS. STITT:**

Yeah, he wants a written invitation.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Who is that? Do I know that person?

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Well, I think there was the New York State veterinarian who we also suggested that we invite and we reached out to the office there and we have to put a formal request in.

**MS. STITT:**

Yeah, it was Joe who called. I can't remember, it was -- I can't remember.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. Well, we have the equestrian expert from Cornell, she's willing to do a phone conference in from Upstate.

**MS. STITT:**

Yeah, she's going to do a phone conference.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

So at the next meeting we're going to look to maybe host the meeting someplace where they have speaker phone capabilities and we can have her call into the meeting and give us Cornell's suggestions regarding what you need to have for each horse that you have, I guess, is what we're looking at. So I guess that's where we are with the meeting today. And --

**MS. STITT:**

Jennifer Conte is her name.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

This is from Upstate New York?

**MS. STITT:**

This is, yeah, from Saratoga.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay.

**MS. STITT:**

She'll do the phone conference.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay.

**MS. STITT:**

And then Dr. James {Gray}, he is the State veterinarian.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay.

**MS. STITT:**

And he's the one that wants a written letter, a written invitation to come to the meeting. I will just make a copy of this for you, Rob, and I'll give it to you.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. Does anybody have anything else they would like to add regarding specific needs of any of these types of places?

**MR. BROWNING:**

I guess with this stuff, you know, as far as different ways to manage the manure and all that, also to look at like cost and what would it cost for, say, the guy that only has two, three horses and only

boards a couple. Because, you know, maybe he's boarding a couple because -- or she's boarding a couple to offset the cost of owning a horse, you know, and they're not making any money on it. So then to throw another cost might be tough, you know, for those, you know, those people.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MR. BROWNING:**

So it might be just something to think about, you know, like what -- you know, would it be mandated that they have to do this? Or -- and if it is, then is there any way that they can --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Yeah, and I think that's kind of where they're getting at, Sean. There's a lot of people who would do just that, they have -- right, Denise -- a couple of extra horses on their property that they board so that they can help offset their own costs of what it costs to do all those things that you have to do when you own a horse?

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

That's why we wanted to try and address it for a professional facility that functions as a business and then a backyard owner, keep them separate because it is going to be, like you said, an extra expense rather than a help if we add all of these increased responsibilities to them.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Well, what do, you know, like the two or three stall barns do with their manure; they just pile it somewhere?

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

It depends on where they are. I mean, that's why we have to come up with some kind of ratio as far as the size of the property and how many horses you're keeping.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

And that I don't know how to address. I was hoping that Joe from the Farm Bureau was going to be able to give us a little bit more help with that. You know, I do -- I have three acres in Brookhaven, I can have six horses there. For me, my living space for the house and the yard, I would keep four comfortably and be able to compost and have a small grazing area and be able to manage working and keeping it clean and living, that would be okay. If I had more than that, it would start to become a problem for me to keep it clean, and even with the neighbors far away, not come into a problem.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

But I compost.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

But I used to also be in that business where I sold the compost and made topsoil and got used to it. I'm not anymore, but I still have access of getting rid of it because I have equipment and I still have a small dump truck.

**MS. INTEMANN:**

My farm where I keep my horse is a small backyard barn and most of the manure that's removed there goes to farmers. He has an arrangement. And anyone can come in and pick up manure and he also will load, he has a tractor and will load up a van or whatnot to take the manure out. I have other friends that have a backyard barn and they have a truck and what they do is they fill it with manure and take it to the dump once a week. So those are two other ways of addressing that problem for small barns.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And the dump is not cheap --

**MS. INTEMANN:**

No.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

-- either. You know, like that -- and it goes to their own little separate compost section.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Where they compost the material.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right. And I already told you about the Holtsville Ecology site deal where they used to compost it and they send -- if you ask for some composted material, they give you a garbage can full. And when I dragged my trailer in there and dumped it and said, "Could I fill this up now with compost?"; no, garbage can full. And then two weeks later, "We can't take anymore manure, we have too much."

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

They don't have enough room maybe to --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Well, they should be giving it away in larger containers than garbage can fulls. When somebody pulls in with a trailer like mine or even bigger, maybe landscapers, whatever, they should be giving this stuff away to anybody that wants it, not just in a garbage can full.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Right, and then especially if they're turning away other manure.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right, exactly.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

They're defeating the purpose --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

That made no sense to me.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

-- of the composting, and then they're putting the burden on the landfill.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Exactly.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Because you don't want to be putting it in the landfill either.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

I have a customer who has a two-horse barn and they're in Islip and they bag their manure -- it has to be manure, not garbage -- and the town actually picks it up free of charge and takes it away for them.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Wow.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

And they can put ten bags out, 15 bags out.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Cool.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

But not everybody is allowed to do that.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

Where is this?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

In Islip.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

You have to be in a certain area, or you have to have a certain name or what's the deal with that?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

I don't know. But when I was teaching over there, I would see the bag, I still see the bags, and it's a pain in the neck now, I mean, they have their barn all the way in the back --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

It's free.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

But it's free.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And the manure is gone.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

They don't have to drag it and bring it, and they don't have to pay like I have to pay a dumpster. But they only have two horses.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right. I mean, it's a pain in the neck for me to drag the trailer every week over to the place and dump it when it's frozen like, you know, a block of ice in the trailer. Yeah, a big pain in the neck. But you know what? It's free and I don't have any manure on my property. So, I mean, as horse owners, we have the responsibility --

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

If you can get the manure out --

**MS. MAHONEY:**

One at a time.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

-- you have no -- excuse me.

**MS. MAHONEY:**

I'm sorry.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Yeah, if you can get your manure off your property, your neighbors are not going to be arguing about flies.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

That's right.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I think it would be in everybody's best interest if we could make a conscious effort to make some kind of deal with the Farm Bureau, because all around it doesn't just help us, it's a landfill issue, too. So it should be composted, it should be recycled all around us.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Exactly.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

It's in everyone's best interest. It's just a matter of --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Exactly.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

-- meeting up with Joe. And he did say in February, so I'll --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Oh, good.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

-- try and work that out.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

I think the trick may be finding somebody who's actually willing to go and drive around and do the pick up. Because for each individual owner, especially if you're talking your operation is in Huntington, perhaps, to get it out to Riverhead is a bit of a hike and to get it any further east than that is even more. Perhaps what we need to try to work out with Joe is something where there's actually an individual who comes out once a week maybe and does the whole collection and brings it out to them.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Either that, or if you -- if we're trying to make an effort to come up with some kind of plan and the farmers agree to take it, maybe each town then would come up with a central area where it can be dumped and the farmers can pick it up, and then it's easy for everybody.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Like a transfer station.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

A transfer station, that's exactly it; one for each town.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Perhaps within their landfill. Okay. I think you'll --

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

It would need to be.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

You'll start coming into very big problems trying to find a location that's not in existence now that you could create a manure transfer station.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

Yeah, it's very difficult, I'll tell you that, from a DEC standpoint, when you start modifying an area like that. Landfills already are hot-button issues for folks, and then if you start adding a massive facility, adding that much material, it could be very difficult, especially if you're talking about the need for active management of manure. It's one thing when somebody just dumps their leaves, you're not getting odors from that, so if they sit there for a year or two, it's not a big deal. It's when you start bringing other things like manure and grass clippings. If you remember, grass clippings used to be taken and then years ago all the towns banned them because the grass clippings are what cause the odors. And unless somebody is turning that material every day --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

It's when you turn the material that causes the odor, it's not when it sits.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

But the problem is other -- but when you're dealing with a massive amount of material like that and then sitting there, the stuff develops a kind of fungus known as aspergillus, which that's why Islip Town, for example, doesn't take grass clippings anymore. They had issues with somebody sued them who had a compromised immune system, they got infected by aspergillus spores and I think either they died or, you know, were severely impacted by that.

But the problem, if you notice the trend in terms of recycling has been to diffuse composting. The towns used to do it and now you have some like -- what's the company, Long Island Compost, for example.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Uh-huh.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

Long Island Compost goes out to individual farms instead of going to one large massive facility, a central facility and spreading it out, to reduce the odor impact and the impact on specific areas.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Well, if that's what the new trend is, then we just follow somebody's plan that's already in place.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

I think what you're talking about more is perhaps an exchange or a cooperative.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

I think that's what we're looking for.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

You know, a clearinghouse kind of thing. That somebody, perhaps the farmer, can act on that, you're making the arrangements here. Your farmer X needs so many tons of manure and we have this much at Huntington, you know.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

It has to keep moving.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

Right. But somebody, if you just have that kind of arrangement, kind of like the Pine Barrens Credit Program or whatever, somebody has credit to sell, somebody else has credits to buy, you know, or has a need for credits, just making those connections.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

I think the trick, though, is you're going to have to find someone who's not only the facilitator making the connections, John, but someone who's going to actually go and make the deliveries.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

Right.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Because it's tough for individual property owners who may have two horses on their property to take that garbage can once a week and deliver it someplace, and it's equally tough for the farm owner to make a trip to Huntington to drive around neighborhoods every week to pick up what the material needs, right? So I think that's why we talked about a transfer station, but perhaps there's an easier way. I mean, I would have to think that there might even be, you know, a potential business opportunity for somebody to actually start doing that.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

We had a place in Islip that was taking our manure and he was mixing it with sand and trying to make fertilizer and all -- topsoil and all. But what happened was with him, he had to close down because he was taking in more than he could get rid of. And it was not the odor but the actual runoff, the rain and all would kind of runoff towards neighboring areas and that was a no-no and they closed him down because he just couldn't pump it out, and that was the one station where a lot farmers, a lot of stable owners would go to dump; that's no longer available.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And I do think that we need to view this as if you're going to have horses in your yard, you will have some sort of responsibility to your manure removal and numerous other things.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Absolutely.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

So that if it's -- if you think, you know, getting your manure out of your yard is a big deal and you have to pay \$200 every two weeks for that, I think that's -- I think that's a big deal.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Yes.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

But if it's a free deal, I'd jump through numerous hoops to lose my manure.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I agree with Janet, if it's free and you're taking on --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Put your manure in your back of your pick-up truck and take it where it has to go, and do it as neatly and cleanly as possible. Don't throw your garbage where the manure goes. Don't throw anything else. Do it the right way, it's a free deal, or -- I mean, in my opinion, \$7 a week for us is not a lot of money. I had dumpsters, I know what the dumpsters were costing, you know.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Mine is cheap. There's guys that are paying more than I pay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And Rocky is a good person to be talking about this because he's in that business, he hauls manure for people, and it's not cheap. I don't know what his deal is, he was telling me how cheap it is; he's the one that found us the farmer that we're taking it to now for us. But, in my opinion, if it's free or close to free -- \$10 a week is not a lot of money -- I'm there. Where do I drive, where do I drag it to? I really think we need to view it a little bit like it is that -- the horse owner, barn owner, you want to have horses in your yard. Well, no one is just going to show up and put the manure from the back of the house into a place and take it away for you, you have to do some of these this yourself.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I agree. We're here to set, you know, standards for responsible people.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right, but you have to be responsible.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Yes.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And we have to teach them to be responsible.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Educate them.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

That's part of the goal here. It's not just to make life easy for them, it's to educate them so that life is easy for everybody.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. So, I guess --

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

We had a question.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Yep.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

And maybe John would be able to answer it. Are golf courses able to take manure or are there fertilizing standards --

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

No, they don't -- that's -- manure is really meant more for, say, crops, not for -- it's never used on grass, and we already use organic materials. But it's -- to try to get it to a form that you could utilize it would be very difficult.

**MS. INTEMANN:**

What about greenhouses?

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

Greenhouses? I don't know enough about it.

**MS. INTEMANN:**

Nurseries.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

Nurseries more likely because they're outdoors. I think greenhouses, again, it's a very controlled environment. You're talking about small quantities and you're talking about potting materials and so forth. It's a lot of handling and I think you're talking about something that's going to have to have been composted already for them to utilize it. They won't be able to utilize raw manure. You know, they'd have to -- if they took raw manure, they'd have to process it themselves, compost it until it's fine material and to use it in their process.

**MS. INTEMANN:**

Okay.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Twenty-five years ago when I lived in East Northport, it was the Town of Greenlawn, and they had plots that people would use to grow vegetables and they would take all that I could bring and they would, you know, sometimes give me vegetables because they were happy to get it. A lot of them wanted it broken down to be used for the vegetables, and some of them wanted it actually to be raw because it was a way of deterring weeds and they were putting it in the rows, the raw stuff, and stopping weed growth. So there was ways. That's 25 years ago.

I don't know if that place is in existence anymore, but that was a working situation and they were taking a large volume of manure.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Co-op gardens.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Yeah, and you would get a plot and the old-timers would go out there and that was their little piece of land and they would, I don't know, buy it every -- you know, rent it every year -- how they did their end. But I knew that I was welcome to go there rather than the landfill, which was expensive.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

Well, you still have farms and there's still some small farms in Huntington. You have some in Smithtown, and so it's possible maybe the Farm Bureau could make contact with some of those and see for those western towns if there's a need. There might not be a massive quantity but every little bit could help.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. And getting back to the zoning and recommendations to the towns, I guess then what we're going to say is there's definitely a difference in the amount of property one would have to own if they wanted to own horses and compost versus owning horses and (inaudible word); correct; a fair statement to make? I mean, you're going -- it's going to take X amount of time for that 2.4 cubic feet of material to compost as opposed to just storing it for the week or so to ship it away.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Uh-huh.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

It's all true. I just don't how to present it in --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

I think that --

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

In Islip they have -- it's half acres, correct? You could have a horse on a half acre?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay. I have a thing that might give us a clue.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

And if you have a half acre, you can't compost, or I wouldn't think.

I would think it would be very difficult to be able to compost material if you own one acre --

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

I thought it was one acre.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

In Islip.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Well, there's several different areas of Islip.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Not more than two horses for each one acre of land in Islandia.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

The village is there.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Otherwise I have -- the rest of them don't allow or don't have.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Well, I think what I'm getting at is what I'm -- you know, we want to make recommendations and ask the towns, if I'm not mistaken, instead of doing their equestrian zoning or determining how many horses one could have per property based upon the number of horses one has per property, we want to make recommendation -- we want them to do it based upon the type of facility the person is presenting.

So we would want to go into the town and have, say, a site plan that they would present to the town and say, "Here's my barn, here's my manure storage facility, here's my riding pen, here's my turnout area," what have you, so that the town could take a look at it from the perspective of does this facility provide the proper needs so that one could put ten horses on that facility, whether that facility is within five acres or that facility is on 20 acres. Is that where you're looking to go with this?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Well, I think that creating floor plans is going to be difficult for the existing farms. That won't meet your floor plan.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

You would have to think of grandfathering.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

There would certainly be some grandfathered properties, just as there's probably grandfathered properties now. We would be telling them to start something new, they're not going to be necessarily able to change what somebody is already doing.

But would that be the way to go about this as opposed to saying to people that you could only have one horse per acre? I mean, is that the way we've developed the standard of what we're going to suggest to the towns that they have? And I guess the next question is is it even something the towns would remotely want to consider doing?

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

That's interesting.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I'd like to just bring up two points on the one horse per acre, two horses per acre, or whatever, that I came up with as to how many is too many. My one point is sometimes five on three acres is too many and 17 on three acres is just fine. And my other point is that if you said two horses per acre and the person owns an acre of land and he owns a 2,100 square foot home with a circular driveway --

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Swimming pool.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

-- a swimming pool and a detached garage -- and again, going back to what Nicole had talked about at the last meeting which was the acre sustaining the horse; we can eliminate that whole theory right now because on Long Island there is no acre that sustains any horses. No one thinks that way, it doesn't happen that way.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

So now you're -- when we go back to our acre of land that has the swimming pool and the vegetable garden on the side and a detached garage and a circular driveway and the house is set back, you know, the front lawn set back 40 feet off the property line, blah, blah, blah. Now we have two horses that are on at best a half an acre of property.

So I want to bring both of those to mind, those ideas to mind, that sometimes we can sit here and say, you know, two or three horses on one acre is not enough, too much, whatever. It all depends upon, like you said, layout, but we can't pigeon-hole every single place into the same layout.

And I also think it all depends upon, you know, the people that are trying to follow the rules and, you know, the rules that are there reasonably. You know, some of the rules that are there aren't reasonable at all, but both of those.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

That layout is very interesting, because in some areas horses have to be behind the home. They can't be in your front yard.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yeah, I have that issue.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

There you are with two acres of land, but your house is set back so far --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

-- that all your land is in front of you and it's wasted space.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I have a lot of road frontage. My house is over in the front corner and I have a lot of road frontage, and after the house it's an additional 250 feet of road footage. So I have fencing and my front field goes right up to the road. Technically, all of my horse-related activities must be behind the house.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

According to the town's standards?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yes, according to the town standards. Me personally, I'm going to think that everything that I have and do right now is grandfathered in, but I've never poked that tiger.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

You don't want to.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

But it was told to me that if I wanted to be in compliance I needed to move the fence back and that would probably be two-thirds of an acre that would just sit over there next to my house and do nothing for me but accumulate taxes.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And we would also probably have people parking on it and throwing sofas on it. You know, the way it is now, it looks very nice and everyone stops on the road and looks at the horses. But apparently, and I'm in Brookhaven, they want me to have all my stuff behind the fence.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I have the same.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

You have the same situation?

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

It's situated behind the house. They are housed in the back, I have all -- a lot of, you know -- mine is a very funny S-shape.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

So where -- the house is 280 feet off the front.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Oh, okay.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

And then from the back of my house juts back like 700 feet and then there's a little jet to this way, a

little jet to this way, but the whole front corner is lost because it's on the front. Now, we had proposed at one time if we double-fenced, because the --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

-- issue is is if someone puts their hand over it's a liability.

So if you propose a double-fencing in the front of the house, then nobody has access to the animals.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Okay. Right.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Was that agreeable?

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

We just asked about it. My guys are all in the back. I suggested it to somebody else, it never really came to fruition for anything. It is an idea.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

But that would be a great recommendation. If you wanted to follow that kind of, you know --

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

If someone's property was limited to the front, then a double fence would help alleviate any liability, because it did come down to liability.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

So kind of that planning idea, bringing your plans to see how many horses your land would sustain, makes a little more sense than just what Janet said; throwing this arbitrary number of horses on an arbitrary piece of land, because every piece of land is unique.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

What Rob is suggesting as far as the site plan and what the facility is going to offer, whether it's composting, a dumpster, having a dumpster removed once a week, is along the ideas of what we want to do.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. So in developing that plan, I guess the next question I would have, and perhaps this is one for the next meeting when we have a veterinarian here, but exactly how much space does one horse need in terms of, you know, being able to make sure it gets the exercise and the movement it needs>. I can't imagine that keeping a horse in one of those pokey pens all day long is a good thing for the horse.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

That depends on the animal and what it gets used for. If you --

**MS. INTEMANN:**

And the owner.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

And the owner. But if you have an animal that's ridden regularly, he can stand in a 10 x 10 on the days off and be fine. If you have an elderly animal that can't be used and he's standing in a 10 x 10 or, you know, a 40 x 40 area, he's fine too. A young animal that doesn't get exercised should be in a larger area, you know, minimum 40 x 60, he could stretch his legs a little bit, run around.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

It really -- that the animal dictates. You can't --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And is that our job?

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Yeah.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

To provide quality of life to the equine?

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Well, I think certainly part of the issue is that the town is going to want to make sure that if you have a horse, you have enough room for that horse to survive. And I would say that, you know, our member from the ASPCA is not here today, but I'm sure he would want to advocate for us to have standards that are adequate for the horse. It would be like having a dog and keeping it in a cage all day, it's not exactly something that's good for the dog.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Perhaps it's not our place to tell an owner you can't keep it in a cage, but at the same time is it going to become problematic for the town down the road when people are -- do not have enough space for their horse --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

-- and the horse is just standing in his pen all day. And of course, that owner may not be cleaning their horse and there may --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

I think that's more of it --

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I was going to say --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

-- keeping the pen clean and keeping the area clean, that's more of a problem. When a horse stands in a small 10 x 20 pen all day, all night, and doesn't get -- and that pen doesn't get cleaned, maybe his stall gets cleaned, but the pen doesn't get cleaned, then you have, you know, a health and a fly and odor and dust and the whole nine yard issue.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Denise?

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I was going to say maybe we could just address like health and sanitation issues.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

As far as standards for the size of pens, I'll bring in a copy of our adoption requirements.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

That's a great idea.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

In that way. Because anybody could make an application today and say, "Well, this is the horse I have." And next week, I mean, God forbid that animal dies, anything happens to it, and then the owner goes out and gets a new one or they have a 12 year-old little girl who rides a pony today and in a year or two grows up and now needs a horse because they outgrew what they had when they made the application two years earlier; it's not going to fly. So we can't have a site plan that fits an animal, you have to take that into that consideration.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I'll bring in the adoption papers.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

That's a great idea. I'm sorry, Denis.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Go ahead. Go first.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

From a boarding standpoint --

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

That's where I'm going.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

-- not all horses stay out all day long. My horses rotate so that, I mean -- when you say three acres and 17 horses, believe me, I'm not moving to Kentucky because, you know, of any other reason than I would love my horses to be out all the time. But right now they're on a rotation schedule; they go out individually and they rotate, so they're out for about two, two-and-a-half hours each. I don't know as we as a task force should be the ones to determine how long a horse should be in or out of the stall and where; I'm not sure we're at that point. I think we still need -- don't get me wrong, I would love every horse to be, you know, out on, you know, two acres of grass for the rest of his life. But I don't think Long Island --

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

It's not practical.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

-- yeah, can sustain that theory. So the ideal life-style that we all might think that our horses should have is totally almost unavailable on Long Island.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Well, I think what I'm getting at is perhaps we're not saying that the 17 horses on three acres need to be able -- you know, that each horse needs to be able to run free all day everyday.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

But that there is a riding ring or a turnout ring or some sort of exercise facilities, to put it in no better way, I guess, for the horse so that everyday a horse could go out for a couple of hours and have the space that it needs to actually get a little bit of -- stretch its legs, I guess.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

And as the person running the boarding facility, is he liable for a customer who just wants to plop a horse down, not exercise it, not care for it, not take care of it? Does that person then have to be the person taking care of the horse, or do you get after the person who owns that horse to be responsible for it?

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Well, I suppose it's probably something that you would have worked out in your boarding agreement that you would have with the horse owner, that if that property -- or that owner is not taking care of their horse appropriately, if that's their responsibility in the boarding, that the boarder -- the owner or operator would have some recourse. Maybe they would say, "You're not taking care of your horse, you're going to have to remove your horse from my property."

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

Right, because it's not just a question of size and space.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh-huh.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

It's a question of is the person participating.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Depending on your agreement, yeah, I would think that's certainly an issue.

**MS. INTEMANN:**

The other thing is at my facility also, there's four to five acres and there are about eight horses and there are pokey pens and there are larger turnouts and you have people who never ever, ever come down and see their horse, but they're usually in the bigger pens. And someone like myself who almost rides every single day and trailers out and brings them places, you can have many different owners, activities and so forth in one particular facility. And if you said to them, "Well you need an area where you can exercise, you have to put in a ring," they wouldn't be able to afford to do that.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. INTEMANN:**

You know, and the horses there are very well exercised, even in the absence of a riding ring and so on.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Uh- huh.

**MS. INTEMANN:**

And you may see one horse out in a little round pen, but you can bet that horse may be out trail riding for three hours. So that, you know, it's hard for someone who doesn't know horses to stand on the outside and look in and see, you know, all the different activities that go on.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yeah, like small backyard places that are on parks. They don't have riding rings because they're on the park and they're going to go ride in the park, you know, and they may have small turnouts.

But to bring a point up, just a perfect example of a place that has absolutely no turnout and no outside activities whatsoever is a place that I don't think is in existence any longer, only by a few years, Claremont Riding Facility and that's in New York City.

**MR. D'VACHIO:**

That's been closed.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

That was a building, a building.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Yep.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

The first level was an indoor arena that they all rode on the first floor. You went up a ramp to box stalls and you went up another ramp to straight stalls or vice-a-versa, whatever that was. But it was a building, there were no -- there was nothing outside, there were no turnouts. You could ride in the park or you could ride in the basement in the indoor arena.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

But you had an option, you had an -- I guess --

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

There was a place to go ride.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

There was a place --

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yes, there was a place that you went out of the barn, you're right.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

You have a facility where the horse, you know, you may not have a turnout area but, you know, you have access to trails and stuff.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Yes, yes. An outside area, yes.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

And I'm just asking the question.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

And too, you have to remember, there are going to be animals that just don't require and some that can't -- I have one that cannot be ridden. He just hangs out, my other guy can sit. When I was pregnant, he sat eleven months; I rode him the first day out, it was like he went out the day before because that's his personality. If you overwork him he gets grumpy, that's just him. You have other horses that need to be worked three and four days a week or else they'll kill you. So that the animal kind of dictates the regime too.

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

Right.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

And so we can't -- Janet's right, we can't dictate the specific needs of the animal. It's more how the facility functions and I think the health and the sanitation issues.

**MS. STITT:**

Rob, we need to break, she has to call for her kids.

**MS. MAHONEY:**

If you're not going to end, I need to make a phone call.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

I think we're probably getting about ready to end, Right? I mean, we pretty much covered everything that we wanted to cover for today and we'll have the New York vet possibly for the next meeting. And we'll have, I guess it's Jennifer from Cornell, Jennifer {Gonte} from Cornell call into the next meeting.

So just to set the date real quick. Do we look to do something in early February? And John, I guess we're going to need to change locations. Yes?

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I was just going to ask, I'm going to try and meet with Joe --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

-- from the Long Island Farm Bureau that first week of February, so maybe we can make it after so hopefully I'll be able to get some information from him. And is it possible that we meet at 3:30 rather than 3:00, just because of my work. I can't get out earlier.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

I think we could do that.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Is that okay with everybody?

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. And to pick a location, do we want to do the next meeting in Hauppauge at the Legislative Building? We'll book the Clerk's Office so that -- their conference room, it's a little bit cozier than the big auditorium. And I think they have a conference -- the phone capabilities that we need.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Okay.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Will that work? And should we look at then maybe -- without seeing the calendar and what the holidays are around there.

**COMMISSIONER PAVACIC:**

The week of the 15th I think is President's Week, so you have school out that week.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Okay. And Denise, you said you wanted to do it later in the month?

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

Well, just so that it gives me time to meet up with Joe. He said February, and then hopefully I'll be able to bring back some information regarding the manure.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Why don't we go for late February, then, and that way we can put all our ducks in a row between now and then, maybe February 24th, would that work?

**MS. PLYMPTON:**

And that's --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

That's a Wednesday.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

A Wednesday, yeah.

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

And I'll e-mail out the documents. And if I have anything that maybe perhaps anybody can help us out with developing between now and then, I'll shoot people an e-mail.

**MS. SPEIZIO:**

I'll forward what Denise had sent me. Again, I'm sorry I couldn't do --

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Sure.

**MS. STITT:**

Okay. We're good, right, Rob?

**ACTING CHAIRMAN CALARCO:**

Thank you, everyone.

*(\*The meeting was adjourned at 4:30 P.M. \*)*

**{ } DENOTES SPELLED PHONETICALLY**